

Studio 402 Reid House 75 King Street Sydney NSW 2000

Statement of Heritage Impact for:

Uniting Waverley War Memorial Hospital Site

This statement forms part of the statement of environmental effects for:

A Planning Proposal to amend the Waverley Local Environmental Plan 2012 (LEP) to facilitate the staged redevelopment of the existing aged care, seniors housing and hospital facilities operating at the site

Date: Version V3.2 of 29th June 2017

Reference to current listings:

In Schedule 5 of the Waverley Local Environmental Plan 2012, are listed the following items which are subject of this statement:

War Memorial Hospital, Late Victorian buildings and former stables (item no. 1449) War Memorial Hospital—landscape (item no. 1591) Federation style detached residences (item no. 1473)

Address and property description:

Birrell and Church Streets Carrington Road	Lot 2, DP 1061588; Lot 1, DP 567694; Lot 7, DP 948185; Lot B, DP 317831; Lot 1, DP 172133; Lot 3, DP 667555; Lots 1 and 2, DP 1061548; Lot 1, DP 948186; Lots 3 & 4 / 593710; 1/212655; 1/166786
125 Birrell Street	Lot 2, DP 1061588; Lot 1, DP 567694; Lot 7, DP 948185; Lot A, DP 317831; Lot 1, DP 172133; Lot 3, DP 667555; Lots 1 and 2, DP 1061548; Lot 1, DP 948186
2–8 Church Street	Lots 1 and 2, DP 630460; Lot 1, DP 167332;Lots 1, 2 and 3, DP 1098550
162-164 Bronte Road	Lot 1, 166786; Lot 1, 1115706

Prepared by:

Hector Abrahams Architects Pty Ltd

For:

Uniting (NSW)

Summary of Assessment

The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item or conservation area for the following reasons:

- Retention of all fabric, spaces and uses ranked Exceptional and High in the Conservation
 Management Plan (CMP)
 Reason for change: the retention is planned for as part of a comprehensive masterplan for the
 site
- Construction of major new entrance from Bronte Road, and landscape axial path, framing and terminating on the central space of the estate, and its focus on the Vickery Building Reason for change: the new entrance and path are the central planning strategy for the site. The strategy delivers a vision of a communal village well connected to the green space spine of Waverley.
- Construction of new buildings for health care
 Reason for change: the buildings substantially renew the site in its historic health use, in accordance with the gift that established it in 1919
- Construction of landscape trees, path system
 Reason for change: the new trees and path system are an interpretation of the garden character of the estate, which although large, is a remnant of its original planted state.

The following aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on heritage significance:

- Construction of large new forms in lower part of the estate, and to the west and south of Ellerslie
 Reason for change: the forms are necessary to deliver the health facilities needed on the site.
 This impact assessment provides a detailed analysis of the possible impacts and criteria for
 addressing them in the DCP stage of consent.
- Removal of two Moreton Bay Figs
 Reason for change: the siting of the new Residential Aged Care (RAC) building requires the removal of the two trees. Twelve major trees are planted across the estate instead of them.
- Street Trees to Birrell Street, Carrington Street and Church Street
 Reason for change: the trees are part of a strategy to provide a green link across Waverley. They impact on views of estate features of exceptional and high significance

The following sympathetic solutions have been considered and discounted for the following reasons:

The masterplan was developed out of a complex array of competing requirements for the site, guided by an analysis of heritage constraints and opportunities. Two main alternatives were considered as part of the masterplan process, each an alternative location for the large RAC building. Although each was of similar impact, because of operational deficiencies they were discarded.

Introduction

This Statement of Heritage Impact accompanies a proposal for consent to a masterplan for the Uniting Waverley War Memorial Hospital site.

As part of the preparation of the masterplan, Uniting commissioned a revision of the *Conservation Management Plan* (CMP) for the site as a whole. This was completed by Hector Abrahams Architects in April 2017. It is important to note that the scope of the CMP was the hospital site as a whole. It does not contain detailed assessment of each building, space and landscape features of the site that is significant. It does recommend that when works are proposed to fabric or spaces of Exceptional or High Significance the conservation plan be reviewed. The scope of the CMP does not include the cottages at 2-8 Church Street, as these have no substantial historical links to the Hospital site.

The report provides an analysis of the impact of the proposed masterplan on the significance of the place and its setting. The impact is assessed against the policies in the CMP and the Assessment of Significance in the Heritage Listings of the cottages in Church Street.

This report was prepared by Hector Abrahams, who is familiar with all aspects of the site. The report has been prepared in the form prescribed by the NSW Heritage Office publication *Statements of Heritage Impact (2002)*.

Description and Naming of Features

The site is a large hospital and health facility that has been purposely developed out of the nineteenth century residential estate of Ebenezer Vickery (1827-1906). A detailed description and photographs of the site are found in section 4 of the CMP. The names of site features in this report are those indicated in figure 1. Site Location Plan, in the CMP.

The area of the planning proposal is larger than that covered in the CMP. The additional area comprises some cottages on Church Street which, although not historically part of the hospital, are items of environmental heritage in the LEP.

Significance

The CMP contains the following Statement of Heritage Significance

Donated to the Methodists by the Vickery family as a memorial to Ebenezer Vickery Jr, the place is an outstanding representative example of private philanthropy and the 20th century conversion of Victorian estates to institutional uses.

The War Memorial Hospital, established in 1922 by the Methodist Church as a memorial to the First World War, occupies the buildings and grounds of the former Edina estate, which is aesthetically and historically significant as a suburban Victorian estate that retains its spatial order, scale and planning, as well as four very good Victorian houses, three of which form a significant streetscape along a rare private streetscape. The Victorian landscape planning is overlaid by a 1920s landscape of significance in its own right, as are the 1930s hospital chapel and main wing.

The site's mansion tower and Norfolk Island pines have landscape urban significance as landmarks within the broader surrounding area.

The State Heritage Inventory contains the following Statement of Heritage Significance for the cottages at 2-8 Church Street

Excellent pair of Federation style semi-detached featuring some outstanding and individual detailing. Local significance.

Proposed Works

The proposed works have been understood from the following masterplan level document: Cox Richardson

Uniting Waverley Master Plan Issue of 13th April 2017

Taylor Brammer Landscape Architects Drawings June 2017 / LA 01-04

A summary of the proposed changes to the place is given below. It is divided into two of the areas of policy given in the CMP.

At the start of each list the main source of information is cited from the masterplan document.

Use

Site (understood from 6.3.2 Proposed Uses)

1. Retain dominant health use to the site

Buildings (understood from 6.3.2 Proposed Uses)

- 2. Retain and expand Independent Living Units (ILUs)
- 3. Retain hospital use to the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block
- 4. Retain and expand Residential Aged Care to new buildings
- 5. Introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to new buildings
- 6. Remove private domestic use and introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to the two cottages at nos. 2-8 Church Street
- 7. Retain community use to the chapel, summerhouse and kiosk
- 8. Retain existing commercial and potentially introduce community services uses and leases to Banksia, Wych Hazel and Ellerslie, subject to future study
- 9. Uses of Vickery (originally Edina) remain undefined, with a commitment to explore options Entrances to the site (understood from 6.3.1 Pedestrian and Vehicular Network first diagram)
 - 10. Retain vehicle and pedestrian historic entrances to Birrell , Carrington and Church Streets
 - 11. Return pedestrian use to original entrance on corner of Birrell Street and Bronte Road
 - 12. Introduce new entrance to Bronte Road
 - 13. Introduce two new vehicle entrances to Church Street
 - 14. Return pedestrian use to original back entrance in Birrell Street
 - 15. Introduce new vehicle entrance to Birrell Street

Fabric

Buildings (understood from 6.3.4 Built Form)

- 16. Retain Vickery, Banksia and Wych Hazel, Ellerslie, 1935 Memorial Hospital Block and Operating theatre addition, Chapel, original Stables, Summer house, Kiosk
- 17. Retain semi-detached cottages 2&4, 6 & 8 Church Street, but remove rear wings
- 18. Remove Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home, Cottage to south of Wych Hazel, Inpatient and Hydrotherapy buildings to the south (rear) of the War Memorial Hospital Building, Conrad Beard Court, Day Centre south of Ellerslie, Day Centre to the south of Ellerslie, Edina Residential Aged Care, Bushell and Johnson Apartments

19. New buildings, for which envelopes only are proposed, to east and south of Banksia and Wych Hazel, in location of former outbuilding north of Vickery, to east of operating theatre addition to Vickery, to south of War Memorial Hospital, to west and south of Ellerslie, and on the western half of the estate in the location of former buildings and adjacent areas.

Landscape Features (understood from 6.3.3 Landscape/Open Space)

- 20. Retain almost all Victorian and 1920s trees
- 21. Remove two Moreton bay fig trees numbered T₅7 and T₅8 west of War Memorial Hospital and one Camphor Laurel T₇1 in the same vicinity
- 22. Retain internal drive from Birrell Street to Vickery and War Memorial Hospital
- 23. Construct new landscape from new entrance in Bronte Road, to edge or main garden space to west of Vickery
- 24. Construct new system of paths in line of original drive, and around main garden space
- 25. Introduce new major trees, two in central Axis, a row on the main garden space to the west of Vickery, several to the south of Ellerslie, one on the site of the original gatehouse, one at the original gates at corner of Birrell and Bronte streets
- 26. Introduce avenue trees to the four streets that border the estate
- 27. Remove on grade car parking from the centre and western side of the site

Heritage Impact Assessment

Assessment against policies in the CMP

Proposed Masterplan strategy		Relevant policy of the CMP (in <i>precis</i>)	Assessment of impact
Use			
1.	Retain dominant health use to the site	Policy 4: The existing institutional governance and hospital use is a historic use that should be continued. Policy 5: The historic use should be broadly defined to include uses related to health, aged care and training.	The future uses proposed in total comply with the policy to preserve this historic use, established by the gift of the Vickery family in 1919.
2.	Retain and expand Independent Living Units (ILUs)	Policy 4: The existing institutional governance and hospital use is a historic use that should be continued.	Retaining and extending ILU complies as a continuation of the historic hospital use
3.	Retain hospital use to the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block	Policy 4: The existing institutional governance and hospital use is a historic use that should be continued.	The proposed use of the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block complies with the policies to preserve this historic use.
4.	Retain and expand Residential Aged Care to new buildings	Policy 5: The historic use should be broadly defined to include uses related to health, aged care and training.	Retaining and extending RAC complies as a continuation of the historic hospital use.
5.	Introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to new buildings		Introducing new health uses and supporting commercial uses complies as a continuation of historic hospital use
6.	Remove private domestic use and introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to the two cottages at nos. 2-8 Church Street	The listing of the cottages contains no policy	The loss of the original domestic use of the cottages will have some impact on their significance.
7.	Retain community use to the chapel, summerhouse and kiosk	Policy 4: The existing institutional governance and hospital use is a historic use that should be continued.	The retention of the chapel
8.	Remove existing commercial and introduce community		There are no specific policies for the use of these buildings, which have not been used as

	T	
services uses and leases to Banksia , Wych Hazel and Ellerslie		houses for many decades. The proposed use is of some positive impact as it will bring more members of the community inside three of the most important buildings on the estate
9. Uses of Vickery (originally Edina) remain undefined, with a commitment to explore options		There are not specific policies in the CMP for the future use of Vickery, other than as part of the historic hospital use. Given the difficulty of finding the right user, it is appropriate that a commitment to finding the best use be made. It should be recognised that Vickery have a use that is integral to the estate.
10. Retain vehicle and pedestrian historic entrances to Birrell , Carrington and Church Streets	Policy 6: The following historic spatial uses relating to the Victorian period should continue or be re-instated: •early entrances and driveway; •upper garden areas as garden /	The retention of the use of these entrances complies
11. Return pedestrian use to original entrance on corner of Birrell Street and Bronte Road	passive recreation.	The proposed re-instatement complies with the policy
12. Introduce new entrance to Bronte Road	Policy 12: the character of new buildings and new landscape features should appear to be a development of the estate as a whole, in a similar way that the 1935 War Memorial Hospital appears in relation to Edina.	This entry adds a major new point of address to the estate. Since the original public entrance at the corner of Birrell and Bronte is never likely to have substantial use again, it is a positive expression of the estate to have this new entrance, with a considered entry sequence to the Vickery building as the main focus of the estate.
13. Introduce two new vehicle entrances to Church Street		The proposed entrance to the west end of Church Street adjoins the two semidetached cottages. It is a service entry but quite large. If it were busy and had big gates, this entry could confuse

	T	-
		the sense of the whole estate.
		The impression of a large
		scale should be minimised,
		and the operation of it not
		disturb the domestic character
		of this end of Church Street.
		The entry proposed towards
		the eastern end of Church
		Street must penetrate a stone
		wall. This opening must be
		detailed to be a well-made
		penetration in a boundary
		wall, with gates and piers
		appropriate to the character
		of the wall in this street.
14. Return pedestrian use to		Although not required by the
original back entrance in		CMP, this proposal reinstates
Birrell Street		a historic pedestrian path, and
		is of positive impact
15. Introduce new vehicle		The proposed entrance to the
entrance to Birrell		Birrell Street adjoins a row of
Street		early twentieth century
		cottages. It is a service entry
		but quite large. If it were busy
		and had big gates, this entry
		could also confuse the sense
		of the whole estate. Its large
		scale should be minimised,
		and the operation of it not
		disturb the domestic character
		of this end of Birrell Street.
Fabric		
16. Retain Vickery, Banksia	Policy 3: The fabric, views and	The masterplan retains the
and Wych Hazel,	spatial relationships ranked	buildings ranked Exceptional
Ellerslie, 1935 Memorial	Exceptional and High should be	and High in accordance with
Hospital Block and	conserved. They areVictorian	this policy.
Operating theatre	buildings	
addition, Chapel,	War Memorial Hospital	
original Stables,	buildings of aesthetic	
Summer house, Kiosk	importance: main building,	
	chapel	
17. Retain semi-detached	As Items of Environmental	The rear wings which are to
cottages 2&4, 6 & 8	Heritage, consent for the	demolished are small and not
Church Street, but	cottages is subject to the	visible from the street. As the
remove rear wings	Waverley DCP for Heritage.	wings are not among the
	The relevant part is Section 8.2	stylistic attributes that are
	Character, which requires (a)	cited in the listing, their
	Development should identify	proposed demolition has no

18. Remove Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home,	and respect the contributory features and characteristics of the item or the conservation area and incorporate these features into the design. Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked	impact on the significance of the item. As these buildings are not ranked of exceptional or high
Cottage to south of Wych Hazel, Inpatient and Hydrotherapy buildings to the south (rear) of the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block Conrad Beard Court, Day Centre south of Ellerslie, Cottage to west of Ellerslie, Edina Residential Aged Care, Bushell and Johnson Apartments	Exceptional and High should be conserved.	significance in the CMP, their removal does not contravene the policy to conserve significant fabric
19. New buildings, for which envelopes only are proposed, to east and south of Banksia and Wych Hazel, in location of former outbuilding north of Vickery, to east of operating theatre addition to Vickery, to south of War Memorial Hospital, to west and south of Ellerslie, and on the western half of the estate in the location of former buildings and adjacent areas.	Policy 10: The siting of new buildings must respect the integrity of estate, its orthogonal and picturesque layouts, and the historic sequence of spaces. New buildings may be placed in the historic lower garden and service court spaces provided those spaces remain discernible. They may replace buildings assessed as being of moderate or low significance. New buildings should not be placed in the upper garden space. Policy 11: the scale of new buildings should be of a scale consistent with the estate. This allows for large buildings; however, new buildings should not challenge the landmark qualities of the Edina tower or the Norfolk Island pines. Policy 12: the character of new buildings and new landscape features should appear to be a	The prescription of the policy to locate new structures in the lower garden spaces and in the service court to the rear of Vickery has been pursued. The siting proposed does preserve open space in each area as required. In particular the surviving lower section of original main drive is not built upon. New buildings in place of Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home, Cottage to south of Wych Hazel, Day Centre to the south of Ellerslie and the Inpatient and Hydrotherapy buildings to the south (rear) of the War Memorial Hospital, is complies. The siting leaves room for a network of paths to extend fully over all of the original estate. The historic sequence of space of the original drive is not

development of the estate as a whole, in a similar way that the 1935 War Memorial Hospital appears in relation to Edina. retrieved; however, a sequence of similar character is achieved on the new Vickery Axis and a viable estate entry is achieved. Detail of future landscape design should be required to express this as a picturesque (not formal) gesture.

Scale

The envelope to replace Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home is three storeyed. This is reasonable; however, future design should not over scale the Banksia Wych Hazel pair. This same requirement applies to the three-storeyed form to replace the Cottage to the south of the pair.

The two storeyed forms in the service court to the east of Vickery and three storeys to the south of the War Memorial Hospital Building correctly match the existing. They must preserve the primacy of the high roofs and towers of each building. The five and six storeyed forms to the south and west of Ellerslie have the potential to appear overbearing in relation to it from Birrell Street and the driveway that leads off it. The proposed planting of major trees could ameliorate this.

The five to eight storeyed forms on the lower garden, are quite commensurate with the grand scale of the Fig and Pine trees on the estate, and so are not inappropriate to the character of the estate as experienced internally. The scale of the form seen from Bronte Road, south of

20. Retain almost all Victorian and 1920s trees 21. Remove two Moreton bay fig trees west of War Memorial Hospital and one Camphor Laurel nearly 22. Retain internal drive from Birrell Street to	form, be of materials suitable to be seen as the backdrop to the houses, and be visually related to and part of the architectural character of the estate. Character It is clear from the landscape proposal, where major new entrance, large trees and a full network of paths is proposed that there is a clear intention to extend the character of the estate. This is reinforced in the siting of buildings at the perimeter, leaving the central grand spaces intact. As the architectural character of the proposed envelopes is given only as impressions, it is not possible to assess the effect on the built character of the estate as a whole. The masterplan retains most of the trees ranked Exceptional and High in accordance with this policy The removal of two original trees is a significant loss of fabric in the landscape. The impact is ameliorated by the replacement planting of about twelve major trees across the estate. The loss of the Camphor Laurel is not of as much impact, as its condition is poor. The retention of this part of the original landscape concept complies with the policy
---	---

23. Construct new landscape from new entrance in Bronte Road, to edge or main garden space to west of Vickery	Policy 8: Creatively interpreting aspects of the history of the place should be considered as opportunities arise, including Develop the site with an appreciation of its identity as a single planned estate; Develop the site with an appreciation of the spatial order of the estate, which is contiguous over all of its history to date.	The proposed new entry and The components of the original sequence were iron gates, gatehouse, major fig trees, route around a pond and termination at stairs leading to the upper garden space. The components of the new way are a paved entry court, junction with original path space (James Green Walk), community hub, sequence of landscape gardens framing the axial view to the upper garden space, and termination at the original location. Vickery Axis pathway complies as a substantial interpretation of the lost original front drive to the estate.
24. Construct new system of paths in line of original drive, and around main garden space		The new network of paths reintroduces a complete network over the entire estate. It reinstates former paths in the James Green Walk, to the west of Ellerslie and around Vickery and the upper garden space. Other paths are not original, but do connect all of the estate. In so doing, it is a good interpretation of the significance of the place.
25. Introduce new major trees, two in central Axis, a row on the main garden space to the west of Vickery, several to the south of Ellerslie, one on the site of the original gatehouse, one at the original gates at corner of Birrell and Bronte streets		The new trees substantially augment the scale of the existing major trees of the estate they are a good extension of the character of the estate.
26. Introduce avenue trees to the four streets that	No policy	Street trees on all four sides of the site will obscure some of

border the estate		the fabric and character of its perimeter. In particular, the iron gates at the corner of Birrell and Bronte, the avenue of Palms at the Birrell Street entry, views of the Vickery Building from Carrington Road. The proposal appears to replace the street trees in Church Street, which already obscure the view east to the fine terrace in Carrington Street and the Church
27. Remove on grade car parking from the centre of the site	Policy 9: The following reconstructions, removals and plantings should be considered: Removal of glass portico to reveal front entrance of 1935 Hospital; Replacement of concrete driveways with more sympathetic material;	Building. This proposal complies with the policy and is of positive impact.
28. Allow for future replacement planting of significant trees	Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved. Under the definition of Conserve, significant landscape plantings that become senescent should be replanted.	There is no proposal in the masterplan to make replacement planting for the major trees. This should be a condition of Development Approvals
29. Introduce new car parking facilities	Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved. They are: Victorian buildings and estate planning: topography, plantings, fences, statuary and spatial order (including the private street, original drive and distinction of service areas (stables and kitchen) from formal areas;	Since the proposed car parking is located underneath the new buildings there is no impact on the significant Victorian spatial order. This is a positive heritage impact.
30. Remove on grade car parking from the centre of the site	Policy 6: The following historic spatial uses relating to the Victorian period should continue or be re-instated: early entrances and	Existing on grade parking is removed from the centre and west part of the site. This is of positive heritage impact, as it returns the central garden

	driveway;	space to its original passive
	• upper garden areas as	use
Interpretation	garden / passive recreation	
31. Construct new garden drive (pedestrian only) as an interpretation of the original driveway	Policy 9: The following reconstructions, removals and plantings should be considered:Recreation of the original driveway path, in a manner similar to the original path (this would require the removal of buildings);Construction of some built or garden form on site of original gatehouse (to mark entrance).	The proposal to reinstate an entry sequence from the original driveway gates to the Edina complies with the policy In the masterplan proposal, the new route is called the James Green Walk and Vickery Axis. It connects all parts of the original drive, vis. the original gates, large Moreton Bay Fig trees, axis of Vickery, and the central garden space. Its character should be developed in detail to interpret the character of the original estate
32. Replant missing trees in the centre of the site		The missing large trees on the western edge of the central lawn are being replanted
33. Introduce new entrance to Bronte Road	Policy 8: Creatively interpreting aspects of the history of the place should be considered as opportunities arise, including Develop the site with an appreciation of its identity as a single planned estate; Develop the site with an appreciation of the spatial order of the estate, which is contiguous over all of its history to date.	The proposed new entry in my view does serve to present the estate to the Bronte Road in a new way improves its profile. This is consistent with the policy

Conclusion

This high-level heritage assessment of a masterplan finds that, assessed against the policies of a current CMP, the proposal has important positive impacts on the significance of this site.

1. It is a vision to renew the historic health use on a community concept.

It is central to the history and significance of this site that the nineteenth century Vickery Estate was gifted to the Methodist Church for a hospital, and the Vickery family remained active in the hospital. When measured against the historic use and intentions for the site, the vision of the masterplan to create "a broader restorative place", is found to be highly

consistent with the cultural significance of the site. The compatibility is in terms of use and retention of the buildings and estate which were gifted to the church.

2. It seeks to interpret the whole of a historic estate which was given to this use by the Vickery family in 1919.

This assessment finds the proposed arrangement of space on the site displays a good understanding and makes a strong interpretation of the estate as a whole. This is of very positive heritage impact. Whilst it is common for heritage to be sidelined in sites of historic estates, in this case the historic spatial order of the estate has been recovered more fully and new spaces and buildings arranged in response to it. In particular, the primacy of the Vickery and Hospital buildings amid their large trees is preserved by the locating of new tall buildings well down the slope to the west.

3. There is no major loss of heritage significance as a result of this proposal.

This assessment finds that two significant Moreton bay fig trees sited to the west of War Memorial Hospital will be lost. This loss is ameliorated by the considered planting of twelve major trees on the estate. Whilst the loss is important, in our view the recovery of a comprehensive landscape of the estate is of more importance.

Since the proposal seeks approval to a high-level masterplan, it is appropriate for conditions of approval to make explicit the requirements for future applications under the masterplan consent.

The preparation of a site-Specific Development Control Plan should be based on the policies of the CMP as well as this masterplan

Hector Abrahams

Hector Abrahams Architects

Elector Abrahams.